



PRESERVE

Peer REviews for Sustainable Eco-Regions Via Europe



Welcome!

PRESERVE Conference:

Innovation & Sustainability in Tourism: Regions present ideas and solutions

WELCOME

- ↪ **Massimo Umiliati**, President of Eurobic Toscana Sud S.p.A.
- ↪ **Michèle Sabban**, President of Assembly of European Regions, Vice-President of Ile-de-France (F)
- ↪ **Cristina Scaletti**, Regional Minister for Tourism of Tuscany (IT), President of NECSTouR
- ↪ **Anna Maria Betti**, Councillor of Siena, Responsible for Tourism

WELCOME

↪ **Massimo Umiliati**, President of Eurobic Toscana Sud S.p.A.

WELCOME

- ↪ **Michèle Sabban**, President of Assembly of European Regions, Vice-President of Ile-de-France (F)

WELCOME

- ↪ **Cristina Scaletti**, Regional Minister for Tourism of Tuscany (IT), President of NECSTouR

WELCOME

↪ **Anna Maria Betti**, Councillor of Siena, Responsible for
Tourism

OPENING: Tourism in Europe - New Challenges, Opportunities & Results: Keynotes

Moderated by Mariejose Zondag (Ecorys)

- ↪ **Giommara Uggias**, Member of European Parliament, Shadow-Rapporteur on the European tourism strategy
- ↪ **Juan Ignacio Gonzalez Bastero**, Head of Cabinet of Harald Noack, European Court of Auditors

OPENING: Tourism in Europe - New Challenges, Opportunities & Results: Keynotes

Moderated by Mariejose Zondag (Ecorys)

- **Giommaria Uggias**, Member of European Parliament, Shadow-Rapporteur on the European tourism strategy

OPENING: Tourism in Europe - New Challenges, Opportunities & Results: Keynotes

Moderated by Mariejose Zondag (Ecorys)

- **Juan Ignacio Gonzalez Bastero**, Head of Cabinet of Harald Noack, European Court of Auditors

“Were ERDF co-financed tourism projects effective?”



Were ERDF co-financed tourism projects effective?

PERFORMANCE AUDIT
EUROPEAN COURT OF AUDITORS
Chamber II

Juan Ignacio González Bastero
Head of Private Office Dr Harald Noack, Dean of Chamber II
20 October 2011

Why an audit on Tourism ?

- Largest service industry in the EU and the third economic sector worldwide
 - Taking into account related sectors 10% of GDP and 12% of the labour force
- Important for growth and employment
- ERDF expenditures amounted to € 8 billion of which 4,6 billion on physical investments in tourism (2000 – 2006)

Main audit objective :

Were ERDF co-financed tourism projects effective?

- To assess whether projects:
- delivered the results expected of them (tourism activity, tourism capacity and job creation)
 - have produced sustainable results
 - were undertaken as a result of EU support

Main phases of the audit

October 2009 – June 2010

Data collection

- e-Survey (random / representative at EU level): 206 completed projects in 9 MS / 26 operational programmes / 369 million euro from ERDF
- Questionnaire sent directly to project promoters (98% replied)

Check of data accuracy / promoters' replies

- Visit of 52 projects in 4 MS / 8 regions
- Verification by Managing Authorities for 154 not visited projects
- Desk review for all 206 projects based on key documents

Data analysis

Some projects visited



Traditional building refurbished to serve as wine museum (France)

Total cost 0,8 million €, of which 42% from ERDF



Historic building converted into a four-star hotel (Spain)

Total cost 1,9 million € of which 75% from ERDF

Some projects visited



Wooden bridge on a river to connect cycling and walking paths and a dock for canoes (Germany)

Total cost 0,14 million €, of which 49% from ERDF



Pavement and railings at the coast to access historical site (Italy)

Total cost 1 million € of which 45% from ERDF

Findings and Conclusions I

- Typology of projects supported:
 - 76 % public / 24 % private
 - 26% for accommodation and catering; 23% for museum ...
- Effectiveness:
 - Weaknesses in defining targets
 - Projects have multiple objectives and results
 - Creating or maintaining jobs (58%), creating tourism capacity (73%) or activity (74%).
 - 44% of projects had results in all three categories
 - Not for all projects objectives were set
 - When this was the case the success rate was about 80% /
rate of women recruited: 23,5%

Findings and Conclusions II

- Sustainability of projects:
 - 98% of projects still operational
 - 94% of jobs created still existed
 - 80% of private projects profitable
 - 60% of public projects not profitable by nature
- Deadweight:
 - 26% of projects would have been carried out without the EU aid (of which 6% would have been identical)

Recommendations

- More use of setting suitable performance objectives, targets and indicators (project selection and evaluation)
- Ensure there is a real need for ERDF funding
- The Commission should undertake an evaluation of the aid offered in this sector - focussing on cost-effectiveness for growth in order to better target support



Thank you for your attention!

Questions ?



PRESERVE

Peer REviews for Sustainable Eco-Regions Via Europe



PRESERVE

Peer REviews for Sustainable Eco-Regions Via Europe

10:30 – 11:00 COFFEE BREAK